

[Skip To MainContent](#)



Civil Court Case Information - Case History

**Case Information**

Case Number: CV2014-006633      Judge: Viola, Danielle  
 File Date: 4/7/2014      Location: DOWNTOWN  
 Case Type: Civil

**Party Information**

Party Name	Relationship	Sex	Attorney
Planned Parenthood Arizona Inc	Plaintiff		Christopher Lavoy
William Richardson	Plaintiff	Male	Christopher Lavoy
Cara Christ	Defendant	Male	Elissa Graves

**Case Documents**

Filing Date	Description	Docket Date	Filing Party
9/20/2016	JUD - Judgment	9/20/2016	
	<b>NOTE: JUDGMENT</b>		
9/20/2016	OCW - Order for Withdrawal of Counsel	9/20/2016	
	<b>NOTE: ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO WITHDRAW AS COUNSEL</b>		
9/13/2016	MFW - Motion For Withdraw of counsel	9/14/2016	
	<b>NOTE: Motion to Withdraw as Counsel</b>		
9/1/2016	ALT - Appeals Letter Of Transmittal	9/1/2016	
9/1/2016	CAO - Court Of Appeals Order	9/1/2016	
8/30/2016	NOF - Notice Of Filing	8/30/2016	
	<b>NOTE: Notice of Filing Amended Proposed Form of Judgment</b>		
8/18/2016	NOF - Notice Of Filing	8/18/2016	
	<b>NOTE: Notice of Filing Proposed Form of Judgment</b>		
8/15/2016	926 - ME: Under Advisement Ruling	8/15/2016	
7/18/2016	020 - ME: Matter Under Advisement	7/18/2016	
5/27/2016	094 - ME: Oral Argument Set	5/27/2016	
5/18/2016	NOT - Notice	5/19/2016	
	<b>NOTE: Notice of Enactment of Senate Bill 1112</b>		
5/3/2016	CAR - Court Of Appeals Receipt	5/4/2016	
	<b>NOTE: C2C TRANSMISSION RECEIPT</b>		
5/3/2016	AIX - Appeals Index	5/4/2016	
5/3/2016	LET - Letter	5/4/2016	
	<b>NOTE: COA/NO APPELLANTS FILING FEE</b>		
4/25/2016	REL - Reply	4/26/2016	
	<b>NOTE: REPLY IN SUPPORT OF APPLICATION FOR AWARD OF ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS</b>		
4/18/2016	RES - Response	4/19/2016	
	<b>NOTE: DEFENDANT'S RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS' APPLICATION FOR AWARD OF ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS DATED MARCH 22, 2016</b>		
4/8/2016	NOT - Notice	4/8/2016	
	<b>NOTE: Notice of Agreed Extension for Time to File Defendant's Response to Plaintiffs' Application for Attorneys' Fees and Expenses</b>		
4/1/2016	NAP - Notice Of Appeal	4/1/2016	
	<b>NOTE: Notice of Appeal/Co Chg \$92.00 Receipt #25152425</b>		
3/22/2016	ASR - Affidavit in Support of Attorney Fees	3/23/2016	
	<b>NOTE: Declaration of Christopher A. LaVoy in Support of Plaintiffs' Application for Award of Attorneys' Fees and Expenses</b>		
3/22/2016	AAF - Application For Attorney Fees	3/23/2016	
	<b>NOTE: Application for Award of Attorneys' Fees and Expenses</b>		
3/4/2016	049 - ME: Judgment Signed	3/4/2016	
3/2/2016	JUD - Judgment	3/10/2016	
	<b>NOTE: Notice of filing and entry provided to the parties</b>		
1/5/2016	RES - Response	1/5/2016	
	<b>NOTE: DEFENDANT'S RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS' OBJECTION TO DEFENDANT'S PROPOSED FORM OF JUDGMENT</b>		
12/10/2015	OBJ - Objection/Opposition.	12/10/2015	
	<b>NOTE: Objection to Defendant's Proposed Form of Judgment</b>		
12/9/2015	NOF - Notice Of Filing	12/10/2015	
	<b>NOTE: NOTICE OF FILING PROPOSED FORM OF JUDGMENT</b>		
11/19/2015	016 - ME: Ext/Time/Filing Granted	11/19/2015	
11/17/2015	ORD - Order	11/20/2015	
	<b>NOTE: GRANTING EXTENSION OF TIME FOR FILING MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS FEES</b>		
11/4/2015	NOF - Notice Of Filing	11/4/2015	
	<b>NOTE: Notice of Filing Proposed Form of Judgment</b>		
11/4/2015	STP - Stipulation	11/5/2015	
	<b>NOTE: Stipulation to Extend Time for Filing Motion for Attorneys' Fees</b>		
10/15/2015	926 - ME: Under Advisement Ruling	10/15/2015	
8/20/2015	020 - ME: Matter Under Advisement	8/20/2015	
8/12/2015	019 - ME: Ruling	8/12/2015	
6/29/2015	REL - Reply	6/29/2015	
	<b>NOTE: DEFENDANT'S REPLY IN SUPPORT OF CROSS-MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT</b>		
6/24/2015	MOT - Motion	6/24/2015	

<b>NOTE:</b> Motion to Substitute Party Defendant		
6/10/2015	NAR - Notice Of Appearance	6/10/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Amended Notice of Appearance for Steven H. Aden		
6/10/2015	NAR - Notice Of Appearance	6/10/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> NOTICE OF APPEARANCE OF M. CASEY MATTOX		
6/5/2015	RES - Response	6/8/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Response in Opposition to Defendant's Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment		
6/5/2015	REL - Reply	6/8/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> REPLY IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT		
6/2/2015	022 - ME: Order Signed	6/2/2015
6/2/2015	023 - ME: Order Entered By Court	6/2/2015
5/29/2015	079 - ME: Case Dismissed - Partial	5/29/2015
5/27/2015	PHO - Pro Hac Vice Order	5/29/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> M CASEY MATTOX		
5/27/2015	PHO - Pro Hac Vice Order	5/29/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> STEVEN H ADEN		
5/26/2015	PHA - Pro Hac Vice Application	5/26/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Motion to Associate Counsel Pro Hac Vice (M. Casey Mattox)		
5/26/2015	PHA - Pro Hac Vice Application	5/26/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Motion to Associate Counsel Pro Hac Vice Steven H. Aden		
5/22/2015	023 - ME: Order Entered By Court	5/22/2015
5/21/2015	ODI - Order Of Dismissal	5/28/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> WILLIAM H RICHARDSON MD PC WITHOUT PREJUDICE		
5/19/2015	NOT - Notice	5/19/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Notice of Change of Address		
5/18/2015	SFD - Stipulation For Dismissal	5/19/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Stipulation of Dismissal of William H. Richardson, M.D., P.C.		
5/13/2015	MOT - Motion	5/13/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Motion to Substitute Party Defendant		
5/6/2015	SOF - Statement Of Facts	5/7/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> DEFENDANT'S SUPPLEMENTAL STATEMENT OF FACTS IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT		
5/6/2015	MSJ - Motion For Summary Judgment	5/7/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Defendant's Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment		
5/6/2015	RES - Response	5/7/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Defendant's Response to Plaintiffs' Supplemental Motion for Summary Judgment		
4/23/2015	023 - ME: Order Entered By Court	4/23/2015
4/15/2015	MOT - Motion	4/16/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Joint Motion to Modify Briefing Schedule		
4/15/2015	NAR - Notice Of Appearance	4/16/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Notice of Appearance for Will Humble		
4/14/2015	ANS - Answer	4/15/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Answer to Supplemental Complaint		
4/9/2015	095 - ME: Oral Argument Reset	4/9/2015
4/2/2015	NOT - Notice	4/3/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> NOTICE OF AVAILABILITY		
3/19/2015	MSJ - Motion For Summary Judgment	3/20/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT		
3/19/2015	MCO - Motion To Continue	3/20/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> JOINT MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE AND CONTINUE HEARING		
3/11/2015	022 - ME: Order Signed	3/11/2015
3/11/2015	AMC - Amended Complaint	3/12/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Supplemental Complaint		
3/10/2015	ORD - Order	3/13/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> GRANTING MOTION FOR LEAVE TO SUPPLEMENT/AMEND COMPLAINT		
1/27/2015	RES - Response	1/28/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO SUPPLEMENT COMPLAINT		
1/15/2015	095 - ME: Oral Argument Reset	1/15/2015
1/6/2015	MOT - Motion	1/7/2015
<b>NOTE:</b> Plaintiffs' Motion for Leave to Supplement Complaint		
12/30/2014	REL - Reply	12/31/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Reply in Support of Motion to Continue Oral Argument		
12/19/2014	RES - Response	12/22/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Plaintiffs' Response to Defendant's Motion to Continue Oral Argument		
12/18/2014	MCO - Motion To Continue	12/18/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Motion to Continue Oral Argument		
11/25/2014	095 - ME: Oral Argument Reset	11/25/2014
11/14/2014	022 - ME: Order Signed	11/14/2014
11/14/2014	REL - Reply	11/17/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> DEFENDANT'S REPLY IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO DISMISS		
11/14/2014	REL - Reply	11/17/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> PLAINTIFFS' REPLY IN SUPPORT OF THEIR MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT		
11/10/2014	ORD - Order	11/18/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> RE DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO EXCEED PAGE LIMIT		
11/3/2014	RES - Response	11/4/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> PLAINTIFFS' RESPONSE TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO DISMISS		

11/3/2014	SOF - Statement Of Facts	11/4/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> DEFENDANT'S SEPARATE STATEMENT OF FACTS IN SUPPORT OF RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT		
11/3/2014	RES - Response	11/4/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> DEFENDANT'S RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT		
11/3/2014	MOT - Motion	11/4/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Motion to Exceed Page Limit		
10/31/2014	STP - Stipulation	11/4/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Stipulation to Modify Briefing Schedule		
10/1/2014	022 - ME: Order Signed	10/1/2014
9/29/2014	ORD - Order	9/30/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> ORDER GRANTING EXTENSION OF TIME		
9/23/2014	RES - Response	9/24/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Defendant's Response to Plaintiffs' Motion for Extension of Time		
9/23/2014	MOT - Motion	9/24/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Defendant's Motion for Oral Argument on Motion to Dismiss		
9/16/2014	MOT - Motion	9/17/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Plaintiffs' Motion for Extension of Time		
9/10/2014	311 - ME: 150 Day Minute Entry	9/10/2014
9/5/2014	MTD - Motion To Dismiss	9/8/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Motion to Dismiss		
9/5/2014	ANS - Answer	9/8/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Answer		
8/13/2014	339 - ME: 100 Day Notice	8/13/2014
8/12/2014	094 - ME: Oral Argument Set	8/12/2014
7/30/2014	019 - ME: Ruling	7/30/2014
7/30/2014	017 - ME: Counsel Appointed	7/30/2014
7/29/2014	ORD - Order	7/31/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> GRANTING MOTION TO ASSOCIATE COUNSEL PRO HAC VICE		
7/25/2014	PHA - Pro Hac Vice Application	7/28/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Motion to Associate Counsel Pro Hac Vice		
7/25/2014	NOT - Notice	7/28/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> NOTICE RE: FILING OF MOTION TO STAY THE NINTH CIRCUIT MANDATE PANDING FILING OF A PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI		
7/18/2014	023 - ME: Order Entered By Court	7/18/2014
7/17/2014	023 - ME: Order Entered By Court	7/17/2014
7/14/2014	NOT - Notice	7/15/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Supplement to Plaintiffs' Motion for Reconsideration		
7/11/2014	RES - Response	7/14/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION OF STAY RULING BASED ON CHANGED CIRCUMSTANCES		
7/3/2014	023 - ME: Order Entered By Court	7/3/2014
6/20/2014	MFR - Motion For Reconsideration	6/23/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION OF STAY RULING BASED ON CHANGED CIRCUMSTANCES		
6/6/2014	928 - ME: Stay of Proceedings	6/6/2014
6/4/2014	NOT - Notice	6/4/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Defendant's Notice of Ninth Circuit Opinion		
5/22/2014	DCL - Declaration	5/22/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Declaration of Mason Legate		
5/22/2014	REL - Reply	5/23/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> REPLY IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO STAY OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE, MOTION TO EXTEND TIME TO FILE ANSWER OR RESPONSIVE MOTION		
5/15/2014	RES - Response	5/15/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO STAY OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE, MOTION TO EXTEND TIME TO FILE ANSWER OR RESPONSIVE MOTION		
5/15/2014	DCL - Declaration	5/16/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Rule 80(i) Declaration of Hamid Jabbar		
5/15/2014	MSJ - Motion For Summary Judgment	5/16/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Motion for Summary Judgment		
5/15/2014	SOF - Statement Of Facts	5/16/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Plaintiffs' Separate Statement of Facts in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment		
5/2/2014	CAN - Credit Memo Appearance Fee Paid	5/2/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Credit Memo/Appearance Fee Paid		
5/1/2014	MOT - Motion	5/2/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Motion to Stay or, In the Alternative, Motion to Extend Time to File Answer or Responsive Motion		
4/23/2014	AFS - Affidavit Of Service	5/5/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> WILL HUMBLE		
4/23/2014	017 - ME: Counsel Appointed	4/23/2014
4/23/2014	SUM - Summons	4/29/2014
4/22/2014	ORD - Order	4/23/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> GRANTING MOTION TO ASSOCIATE COUNSEL PRO HAC VICE		
4/14/2014	PHA - Pro Hac Vice Application	4/15/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> Motion to Associate Counsel Pro Hac Vice		
4/7/2014	COM - Complaint	4/9/2014
4/7/2014	CCN - Cert Arbitration - Not Subject	4/9/2014
4/7/2014	NOT - Notice	4/9/2014
<b>NOTE:</b> OF CLAIM OF UNCONSTITUTIONALITY		

4/7/2014

CSH - Coversheet

4/9/2014

**Case Calendar**

Date	Time	Event
8/8/2014	13:30	Status Conference
12/5/2014	13:30	Oral Argument
2/6/2015	13:30	Oral Argument
4/24/2015	13:30	Oral Argument
8/14/2015	13:30	Oral Argument
7/15/2016	9:30	Oral Argument

**Judgments**

Date	(F)or / (A)gainst	Amount	Frequency	Type	Status
9/20/2016	F:Planned Parenthood Arizona Inc F:William Richardson A: Cara Christ	\$3,952.66	One Time	Costs	
9/20/2016	F:Planned Parenthood Arizona Inc F:William Richardson A: Cara Christ	\$163,146.00	One Time	Attorney Fee	
3/2/2016	A:		One Time	Judgment Only	