GORDON & SILVER, LTD. 1 U.S. DISTRICT COURT ERIC R. OLSEN DISTRICT OF NEVADA Attorney No. 3127 2 AFTER HOURS ELDA M. LUNA Attorney No. 7799 3 3960 Howard Hughes Pkwy., 9th Floor FEB | 6 2005 Las Vegas, Nevada 89109 4 (702) 796-5555 CLERK, U. S. DISTRICT COURT Attorneys for Defendant 5 DISTRICT OF NEVADA 6 UNITED STATES DIST 7 DISTRICT OF NEVADA 8 CV-S-04-1401-RLH/LRL CASE NO.: UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, 9 Plaintiff, 10 VS. 11 CAROLYN A. SHARP a/k/a CAROLYN

Defendant.

REPLY TO PLAINTIFF'S RESPONSE TO DEFENDANT'S EMERGENCY MOTION FOR ORDER TO SET ASIDE ORDER FOR SUPPLEMENTARY PROCEEDINGS OF JUDGMENT DEBTOR EXAMINATION AND PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO VACATE JUDGMENT DEBTOR EXAMINATION

Defendant, Carolyn A. Sharp a/k/a Carolyn Harley ("Defendant"), by and through counsel, the law firm of Gordon & Silver, Ltd., hereby submits her Reply (the "Reply") to Plaintiff's Response to Defendant's Emergency Motion for Order To Set Aside Order for Supplementary Proceedings of Judgment Debtor Examination and Plaintiff's Motion To Vacate Judgment Debtor Examination (the "Response") submitted by the United States Attorney on behalf of the United States of America ("Plaintiff").

This Reply is made and based upon the papers and pleadings on file herein, the following Memorandum of Points & Authorities, and any oral argument the Court may permit at the

....

100358-001/325714

HARLEY,

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

GORDON & SILVER, LTD.
ATTORNEYS AT LAA
NIFFH FLOOR
3960 HOWARD HLGHES FKWY
LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89 09
(702) 796-5555

1 of 5

11

1

hearing on this matter.

Dated this 16 day of February, 2005.

GORDON & SILVER, LTD.

912___

ERIC R. OLSEN
Attorney No. 3127
ELDA M. LUNA
Attorney No. 7799
3960 Howard Hughes Pkwy., 9th Floor
Las Vegas, Nevada 89109
(702) 796-5555
Attorneys for Defendant

MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES

I.

INTRODUCTION

Plaintiff's action is based on a twelve-year old judgment from another state, which is dormant and unenforceable. In its Response, Plaintiff acknowledges that such order is dormant and that there is no need for this Court to remain involved at this time. Plaintiff requests an Order vacating the Supplementary Proceedings of Judgment Debtor Examination of Defendant until further proceedings are undertaken in the state court which issued the original Judgment. For the reasons discussed below, however, this matter should be dismissed, rather than vacated indefinitely pending further proceedings in another state.

II.

STATEMENT OF FACTS

The Judgment upon which this action is based was entered in an Ohio state court in 1993 (the "Ohio Judgment"), a true and correct copy of which is attached to Defendant's Emergency Motion for Order To Set Aside Order for Supplementary Proceedings of Judgment Debtor Examination (the "Emergency Motion") as Exhibit A. Based on an exparte motion, Plaintiff obtained an Order from this Court on October 13, 2004, setting the judgment debtor examination for November 24, 2004. Pending further investigation into the matter at the request of Defendant, Plaintiff obtained an Order from this Court rescheduling the examination of judgment

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

24

23

25

26

27

28

debtor for January 25, 2005.

Having received no report from Plaintiff's counsel concerning its investigation, Defendant then filed her Emergency Motion, pointing out that the Ohio Judgment is dormant and unenforceable under Ohio law and that the debt was previously discharged through bankruptcy. Plaintiff's Response acknowledges that the Ohio Judgment is dormant and unenforceable unless somehow revived under Ohio law.

III.

LEGAL ARGUMENT

Plaintiff obtained a copy of the Ohio Judgment on August 17, 2004 and filed a certified copy with the Nevada District on September 29, 2004, a true and correct copy of which is attached to the Emergency Motion as Exhibit B. The Judgment, however, was entered in 1993. Under Section 2329.107 of the Ohio Revised Code, if no execution or certificate of judgment is issued and filed within five years of the date of the judgment or within five years of the date of the issuance of the last execution or certificate of judgment, the judgment becomes dormant. A dormant judgment may not be enforced and is without legal effect, unless revived under Section 2325.15 of the Ohio Revised Code.

In its Response, Plaintiff acknowledges that the Ohio Judgment is dormant and that there is no need for this Court to remain involved at this time. Plaintiff requests an Order vacating the Supplementary Proceedings of Judgment Debtor Examination of Defendant pending further proceedings in the Ohio state court. Plaintiff indicates that arrangements are being made for the United States Attorneys Office in Nevada to return the case to the Department of Health and Human Services in Washington D.C. for its re-routing to the United States Attorneys Office in Columbus, Ohio for revival of the original Judgment.

The Plaintiff's position, however, does not go far enough. It maintains that this matter should simply be vacated indefinitely pending proceedings in an Ohio state court where revival of the Ohio Judgment may or may not be obtained. Simply vacating the proceedings in this case would leave this action open, but the action was not proper in the first place and must be dismissed. Under Ohio law, the Ohio Judgment is dormant and "is without legal effect." Ohio

The Ohio Judgment is defective for purposes of domestication in Revised Code 2325.15. 1 Nevada and it is defective for purposes of holding a judgment debtor examination in Nevada. As 2 such, the Ohio Judgment is defective for purposes of maintaining an action in this Court. 3 Because this matter is improperly before the Court, it should be dismissed. 4 IV. 5 **CONCLUSION** 6 For the foregoing reasons, Defendant respectfully requests that the Court enter an Order 7 dismissing this matter and granting any other relief it deems just and proper. 8 Dated this by day of February, 2005. 9 GORDON & SILVER, LTD. 10 11 ERIC R. OLSEN 12 Attorney No. 3127 ELDA M. LUNA 13 Attorney No. 7799 3960 Howard Hughes Pkwy., 9th Floor 14 Las Vegas, Nevada 89109 (702) 796-5555 15 Attorneys for Defendant 16 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** 17 The undersigned, an employee of Gordon & Silver, Ltd., hereby certifies that on the 18 day of February, 2005, she served a copy of the REPLY TO PLAINTIFF'S 19 RESPONSE TO DEFENDANT'S EMERGENCY MOTION FOR ORDER TO SET 20 ASIDE ORDER FOR SUPPLEMENTARY PROCEEDINGS OF JUDGMENT DEBTOR 21 EXAMINATION AND PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO VACATE JUDGMENT DEBTOR 22 **EXAMINATION**, by faxing, and by placing said copy in an envelope, postage fully prepaid, in 23 24 25 26 27 28 4 of 5

Gordon & Silver, Ltd. ATTORNEYS AT LAW NINTH FLOOR 39'60 HOWARD FUGHES PKWY LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89109 (702 796-5555

100358-001/325714

Case 2:04-cv-01401-RLH-LRL Document 11-2738554 Filed 02/16/05 Page 5 of 5

the U.S. Mail at Las Vegas, Nevada, said envelope addressed to: Daniel G. Bogden Office of United States District Attorney, District of Nevada 333 Las Vegas Blvd. So., Suite 5000 Lloyd George Federal Building Las Vegas, NV 89101 Fax: (702) 388-6296 Attorney for Plaintiff Vicki Thomas, an employee of GORDON & SILVER, LTD.

GORDON & S.LVER, LTD.
ATTORNEYS AT LAW
NINTH FLOOR
3960 HOWAPD HUGHES PRWY
LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89109
(702, 796-5555

100358-001/325714